

APPENDIX II: COMMENTS BY THE GOVERNMENT OF THE UNITED KINGDOM

Foreign and Commonwealth Office, December 2003

1. Preliminary Remarks

On 9 October 2003, the Committee of Experts set up under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (henceforth referred to as the "Charter") submitted a Report to the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers on the United Kingdom's implementation of the Charter.

The United Kingdom Government values the activities of the Committee of Experts in the process of monitoring the implementation of the Charter and would like to take this opportunity to congratulate the Committee on its thorough and professional approach to the examination of the situation of regional and minority languages in the United Kingdom.

The UK Government attaches great importance to the protection and promotion of regional or minority languages and views fulfilment of Charter obligations as part of the core Council of Europe objectives to ensure the protection of minorities as part of promoting human rights, rule of law and pluralist democracy across the continent.

The comments of the UK Government were drawn up by the Foreign and Commonwealth Office, as the government department with overall responsibility for the conclusion of international treaties. Contributions were made by the devolved administrations in relation to Scotland and Northern Ireland, and by the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister (including the Government Office for the South-West) for Cornish and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport in London.

In view of the above, and taking into account the constructive and positive comments made by the Committee of Experts, the UK Government would like to make the following observations. As well as the points raised here, the United Kingdom Government hopes to be able to address more of the queries raised by the Committee of Experts in its next Periodical Report.

2. Comments on the Committee's Findings and Proposals for Recommendations

Central Government

The UK Government takes into account the findings and recommendations of the Committee and recognises that central government has ultimate responsibility for the fulfilment of the UK's Charter obligations. The UK Government still believes that devolved administrations are better placed to carry out the implementation of policy on regional or minority languages given their local expertise, and does not foresee a centralisation of this process.

However, it is accepted that co-ordination between London and the regional capitals could be improved as a means of sharing best practice and forming a more coherent strategy on language protection across the whole of the UK. The Foreign and Commonwealth Office is currently considering a variety of ways to establish a mechanism to monitor compliance with the Charter and intends to have something in place before the next Periodical Report.

The UK Government is also aware that there is an issue regarding the position of the Charter in UK law. Consultations are currently taking place on language Bills for some of the languages covered by the Charter. Such legal Acts could contain provisions to ensure compliance with the Charter at all levels of government. Further details of progress towards legislation will be contained in the next periodical report.

On broadcasting, the other main area where central government retains primary policy responsibility, the report notes that the strategy of making programmes available on digital television requires special technical requirements for reception, and therefore runs a risk of excluding a minority language from the mass media. The UK Government recognises the Committee's concern but would emphasise that digital television is the broadcasting medium of the future; it is already widely available and the cost of access is modest. Also, the development of digital broadcasting has permitted a substantial increase in the number of hours of Welsh language television broadcasts, which were previously limited by analogue spectrum scarcity.

As noted, provisions contained within the Communications Act 2003 will allow the new Gaelic broadcasting body, the Gaelic Media Service (GMS), to establish a dedicated Gaelic channel when resources become

available. This is an important step, as a dedicated channel would not have been possible under the previous legislation.

Although responsibility for broadcasting is retained centrally, responsibility for the Gaelic Broadcasting Fund was transferred under statute to Scottish Ministers in 1999 as part of the devolution settlement. The UK Government and the Scottish Executive are currently considering, at both Ministerial and official levels, future spending plans with the goal of securing new funds for the GMS.

In 2004 OFCOM, the new Communications regulator, will develop a Programme Code for programme makers which will set out the editorial standards which audiences are entitled to expect from commercial television services in the UK. This code will update and replace the current ITC code. OFCOM will undertake a consultation on this code, and language groups are encouraged to contribute.

The UK Government is currently in the process of reviewing the BBC's Royal Charter. The review will be wide-ranging, looking at all aspects of the BBC's activities, and will involve a great deal of industry and public consultation.

Welsh

The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to creating a bilingual Wales. In March 2003 it officially launched the first ever National Action Plan for a bilingual Wales, *Iaith Pawb* (Everyone's Language). *Iaith Pawb* is the result of a comprehensive policy review of the Welsh language by the National Assembly for Wales. Welsh language considerations will be mainstreamed within the Assembly Government and the language will be a budget priority. An annual report will be compiled on the implementation of *Iaith Pawb*, and the targets inherent within it.

The Welsh Language Board will play a key role in delivering *Iaith Pawb*. That is why the Assembly Government has allocated an additional £16 million over the next three years (between 2003 – 06) bringing their spending to over £37 million. The Board's work is held in high esteem, not just in the UK, but throughout the world. Some of its innovative and wide-ranging work includes the *Twf* Project and *Mentrau Iaith*. The former encourages more parents to choose Welsh medium education for their children, and the latter is a network of innovative local initiatives whose function is to expand the use of Welsh at a community level.

The expertise fostered here in Wales in the field of minority language planning is widely respected and Wales is pleased to share the knowledge and expertise with others, in the UK and beyond. The Welsh Language Board, for example, has played a leading role in setting up and chairing a network of European Language Boards, whilst the Welsh Assembly Government is also taking the lead role in the field of indigenous, minority and lesser-used languages within the British-Irish Council.

The Assembly Government is eager to exploit the full potential of the existing legislative framework which supports the Welsh language. Work is well underway to bring water companies under the ambit of the Act. This is the first instance of the utilities being designated for the purpose of the 1993 Act and shows that we are putting the policy commitments in *Iaith Pawb* into practice.

Recent figures of the 2001 Census suggest that the long-term decline of the language has been arrested. The Welsh Assembly Government intends to ensure that the increase in numbers of Welsh speakers is continued and Wales becomes a bilingual nation. *Iaith Pawb* lays the foundation and strategic direction for the realisation of that vision.

Education

The Welsh Assembly Government generally welcomes this Report's comments on education and training, not least because it acknowledges the very considerable success which the Welsh-medium education sector has achieved, and the international reputation it has gained on the back of these successes – the expansion of early years provision; the increase in the numbers opting for Welsh-medium schooling; the emphasis on the distinctively Welsh aspects of the curriculum (the *Curriculum Cymreig*); the support for embedding the teaching of Welsh to all school age pupils; and the steps being taken to secure progression opportunities overall. There are now Welsh Education Schemes in place for all 22 local authorities in Wales, and the Welsh Language Board plays an important role in monitoring the implementation of targets within these schemes.

There is a great deal of activity in support of Welsh generally in the field of education and training but, in addition, the Assembly Government recognised the need to draw up specific, targeted measures in support of Welsh **over and above** that which is already taking place. These are set out in *Iaith Pawb*. The Assembly Government would draw the Committee's attention in particular to those measures which are being actively pursued during the current year:

- £2m in 2004-05 to improve and increase the training and provision of early years Welsh-medium and bilingual provision;
- £400,000 for the Curriculum and Qualifications Authority for Wales (ACCAC) in 2004-05 to support their work on Welsh-medium materials and qualifications;
- making bilingualism a separate area of learning within the Foundation Phase proposals;
- the review of Welsh-medium education for children and young people with Special Education Needs (SEN) undertaken jointly with the Welsh Language Board, on which a sub-group of the Welsh Advisory Group on SEN will advise on future policy directions;
- remitting ACCAC to advise on issues of linguistic continuity and measuring pupil progress along a linguistic continuum;
- progress with the Welsh Language Board and local education authorities on defining Welsh-medium provision in schools;
- funding the development and implementation of pilot projects to establish second entry points into Welsh-medium education;
- the National Council for Education and Training for Wales (ELWa) has developed a Bilingual Learning Strategy which is an overarching action plan for bilingual learning to ensure that the range of opportunities to enable Welsh-medium learning continues throughout life;
- ELWa is working with experts to identify needs for, and to fund the production of Welsh medium learning resources for the post-16 sector (some 16 projects were underway this autumn);
- requiring the Sector Skills Development Agency to ensure that as a condition of their licence Sector Skills Councils have a Welsh language Scheme;
- the development of an action plan by ELWa to develop National Vocational Qualifications (NVQs) through the medium of Welsh;
- the Future Skills Wales research in relation to Welsh in the workplace and related research commissioned by ELWa on establishing the demands for Welsh language skills from employers arising from the introduction of Welsh Language Schemes in the public sector;
- research on the costs incurred in delivering Welsh medium / bilingual provision in the post-16 sector to inform ELWa's proposals for a National Planning and Funding System;
- joint working between ELWa and the Welsh Language Board on the strengths and weaknesses of post-16 provision;
- the forthcoming start of an ELWa Learning Challenge Fund project to use video conferencing to develop Welsh medium learning opportunities in sixth forms ;
- requiring the 3 main education and training Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies (ASPBs) to mainstream Welsh in their policy development and programme delivery mechanisms in their remit letters – prompting the development of a new approach to Welsh medium provision for post-16 year-olds in Further Education;
- developing, from 2005-06, provision for sabbaticals for teachers and practitioners in schools, Further Education and Higher Education to improve their capabilities to deliver through the medium of Welsh, or otherwise to learn the language so as to do so;
- the continued work of ELWa's Bilingual Sub-committee to advise on developing bilingual learning in the post-16 sector and its links with the pre-16 and HE sectors;
- establishing a Steering Group to develop Welsh medium provision in higher education and introducing Welsh medium Teaching Fellowships for 2003/04, to undertake Welsh medium teaching and develop new Welsh medium modules;
- the Assembly Government has already made clear that the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales (HEFCW) would welcome bids for collaborative projects, eligible for funding under the Reconfiguration Fund. This fund has already supported the new Environmental Science module developed by UW Aberystwyth, UW Bangor and Trinity College, Carmarthen.

For the immediate future, the main priorities relate to support for early years and the development of greater practitioner supply not least by enabling more monoglot English speakers to become bilingual. Both are fundamental to the Government's approach. Thus the early years provide the key to future expansion for learners of all ages regardless of setting. Those years are critical to both demand and, crucially, to building the capacity to deliver. The thrust of *Iaith Pawb* is that in order to make an impact for those areas in which the Committee believes the Government needs to build on its undertakings (e.g. technical and vocational

education) the system must grow the strategic capacity to deliver, notably starting at the grass roots and feeding through progressively over time. This is the basis upon which the Assembly Government is intent on continuing to meet its undertakings.

In relation to the Committee's comments about "the absence of a clearly defined statutory right to Welsh-medium education", entitlement in this context is to a school place. There is no provision for an entitlement to education in a specific language – Welsh or English. Local authorities must take account of parental preference in providing and allocating school places. Where there is demand for Welsh-medium education, authorities need to respond to that demand and to make places available consistent with the provision of effective and efficient education. There is no evidence that significant numbers of pupils whose parents want it fail to secure Welsh-medium education. This is monitored through the School Organisation Plans which Local Education Authorities (LEAs) must produce regularly and which report on the supply of and demand for school places, including in the Welsh medium sector. Provision is currently broadly keeping pace with growth in demand and this is monitored by the Assembly Government and the Welsh Language Board.

Continuity between the stages of education is important to ensure that learners improve their Welsh language skills and that they have the opportunity to learn through the medium of Welsh should they so wish. Structural issues in pre-16 education, insufficient numbers of teachers and reliance upon practitioners to develop learning resources, are more acute in the post-16 sector, and these are being addressed through a combination of provision planning and by investment in training practitioners and developing learning resources for practitioners and learners to use.

The Welsh Assembly Government made it clear that it rejected the "command and control" approach to Welsh-medium education as there is such linguistic variation in different local authority areas and this decision was supported through the Assembly's Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's in depth review of Welsh medium education. The Committee's recommendation on monitoring does not take into account the monitoring systems already in place. For instance, in key areas such as the number of Welsh-medium school places, the statutory responsibility clearly rests with the local education authorities. They must assess the demand. They have the responsibility of working out how to meet it, while at the same time catering for the overall reduction in pupil numbers which is set to continue for the rest of this decade. They must report on this in their School Organisation Plans. In addition they are required by the Welsh Language Act to prepare Welsh Education Schemes which set out the measures they are taking to support and encourage the use of the language through the education services and map the demand for Welsh medium education. In the post-16 sector, ELWa collects a wide range of statistics and is working with providers, sectoral experts and the Welsh Language Board to identify needs and demands for provision. *Iaith Pawb* sets out the strategic framework within which the Assembly Government can operate in support of Welsh and Welsh-medium education and training. Monitoring our progress is built into the process of policy development, implementation and, where appropriate, re-assessment. Insofar as this impinges on the functions of the Welsh Language Board, the "strategic overview" function is of long-standing. The Board does not require additional resources to discharge it. There is no evidence to suggest that current monitoring arrangements are inadequate, although work in hand on firming up definitions of Welsh medium schools should assist the monitoring process.

Health Service

The Assembly Government is well aware of the need to enhance the range of services available through the medium of Welsh. In 2001 an All-Wales Task Group for Welsh Language Services has been established charged with the responsibility for improving and facilitating the provision of Welsh language services in the National Health Service (NHS). The Assembly Government through its strategic Task Group and networking groups within the health service is driving this work forward. There is wide recognition of the need to improve services, especially for specific groups where it is particularly important for services to be delivered in Welsh, for example for those in vulnerable groups.

Work in progress within this area include:

- commissioning a Welsh language awareness training pack to raise awareness of the Welsh language as an important element of 'quality care' for healthcare staff;
- research into Welsh language awareness amongst healthcare professionals within the healthcare sector in Wales – to inform policies and targeting training;

- a Welsh Language in Healthcare conference is staged annually in order to continue to raise the profile and importance of providing Welsh language services and encouraging networking of innovative ideas and best practices between NHS healthcare staff;
- annual awards have been set up to reward efforts made in improving Welsh language provision.

The Task Group is currently setting a range of short and long term objectives to take forward the task of improving Welsh language provision for service users across Wales.

Social Care

Local Authorities have the responsibility for commissioning and providing social services and they strive to meet best practice. The Assembly provides a range of mechanisms to support and monitor their achievement of best practice, and it has taken a number of steps recently to promote Welsh language services.

Clear steps for meeting Welsh language needs at each stage in the social work training process are specified in the Assembly's recently established Social Care workforce Development Programme for Wales, and Social Services Inspectorate Wales routinely reports on the provision of Welsh language services.

The current project to establish an Older People's Commissioner for Wales takes account of the need for Welsh language services as part of the Assembly Government's ground-breaking Strategy for Older People in Wales.

A wide range of measures have also been introduced in relation to children's services. For example, our Framework for Children and Young People requires all Local Authorities to develop strategies that cater for the needs of Welsh-speaking children. Use of the Welsh language is, in addition, a performance indicator for Cymorth, the new, national integrated fund to promote opportunities for children and families in the community.

The Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales, which inspects all care settings, strives to ensure that its inspection processes and materials are available equally in Welsh and English.

Scottish Gaelic / Scots

The UK Government would like to draw attention to developments since the UK's last periodical report with regards to Scotland's minority languages which will address many of the Committee's recommendations. Bòrd na Gàidhlig is now fully established as the primary Gaelic development agency in Scotland and has taken over responsibility for channelling government funding to what it considers to be priority areas of Gaelic language development. The Scottish Executive is mid-way through consultation on a draft Gaelic Language Bill, which is expected to be introduced to the Scottish Parliament in the summer of 2004. This legislation, when passed, will establish Bòrd na Gàidhlig on a statutory basis with considerable powers to focus the development of the Gaelic language in Scotland and will also introduce new opportunities for Gaelic speakers in Scotland to use the Gaelic language.

The proposed Gaelic Bill has a number of key provisions – it would recognise in statute Gaelic as one of the languages of Scotland; would establish Bòrd na Gàidhlig on a statutory basis with the responsibility to produce a national Gaelic plan; would give Bòrd na Gàidhlig considerable powers to channel Gaelic funding; and would introduce a language planning system similar to that in place in Wales to create opportunities for the use of the language in the public sector.

- there are many encouraging signs in Gaelic medium education. Numbers are going up, attainment is good, there is a committed teaching force, resources are improving, we are training more teachers, a Gaelic teachers network has been established and there are good signs of co-operation between agencies. A new Unit opened in Strath of Appin in August 2003;
- have taken recent steps to ensure education authorities further improve their planning of Gaelic medium education. Sending clear reminder to education authorities of their duties under Standards in Scotland's Schools Act 2000; they will be asked to establish thresholds against which they will assess parental demand; and Gaelic medium education SSS Act performance measure will be reviewed;
- the numbers of primary Gaelic medium education pupils has risen from 1859 in 2001-02 to 1925 in 2002-03. Some primary schools in particular have significant increases and in some schools the Gaelic medium

education P1 intake is higher than the English intake. Gaelic medium education secondary pupils have risen from 352 to 375 and pupils in fluent speaking secondary classes have risen from 928 to 997. In addition 4 more secondary schools now offer Gaelic medium education bringing the total to 19. 34 secondary schools offer Gaelic for fluent speakers;

- the numbers for secondary learners has risen from 2131 in 2001-02 to 2370 in 2002-03. In particular S1 learners have risen from 616 to 775 in the same period. Pupils taking the learners Higher have risen from 109 to 133 and Advanced Higher have risen from 17 to 30. In addition the Gaelic Languages in the Primary School (GLPS) Programme is very popular. A review of GLPS has been commissioned (SCILT) and will be available shortly;
- Gaelic arts organisations have received important funding increases in 2003-04 from the Scottish Arts Council, which has in addition published a Gaelic Arts Policy recognising that language is a definitive characteristic of cultural identity ;
- festivals teaching traditional Gaelic music, song and dance are to be expanded as a result of a three-year funding package. Highlands and Islands Enterprise (HIE) are providing £180,000 to Fèisean nan Gàidheal - the independent national association of Gaelic arts tuition festivals - to help them deliver a wider range of services. This package will match funding already provided by the Scottish Arts Council, The Highland Council and the European Social Fund;
- an innovative new distance learning course for prospective primary teachers - including Gaelic medium places – has been launched. The two-year postgraduate course - the first of its kind in Scotland - will be run by Aberdeen University in conjunction with Highland Council and will enable local people to train as teachers without having to move to Aberdeen or to the central belt where the main teacher education institutions are based. The course is based around web learning, video-conferencing, and teaching practice in their local area;
- following the Communications Act 2003 a new Gaelic Broadcasting body will be established in April 2004. Gaelic TV is well regarded, they regularly win awards and their viewing figures are far in excess of the numbers for the Gaelic speech community. BBC Scotland also makes a significant contribution to Gaelic broadcasting – TV, radio and web-site;
- *Learning and Teaching Scotland*, in conjunction with *Stòrlann Nàiseanta na Gàidhlig*, completed versioning some of its most popular software titles for Gaelic school pupils. Through funding from National Grid for Learning. This was distributed to all Gaelic medium schools in Scotland in June of this year. These include *Lifeskills – Time and Money*, *Lifeskills – SmartSpender*, *Healthy Kids – Inside Outside*, *The Serf's Quest – Life in a Medieval Burgh*;
- *Stòrlann Nàiseanta na Gàidhlig* – received an additional £60,000. This enabled them to proceed with two secondary Gaelic projects. They will use this for the development of distance learning materials and for the revision and republication of the dictionary, *Brìgh nam Facal*. A further £10,000 enabled Stòrlann to publish a new Gaelic novel for teenagers and a Maths terminology guide.
- Gaelic Online, has also been launched. This is a new Channel within NGfL Scotland. Funding has been set aside for staffing including content editor, development officer and technical input found from within NGfL budget;
- a Gaelic spellchecker is being developed by The European Languages Initiative (TELI). This team created the Gaelic Parliamentary Dictionary. With support from Comunn na Gàidhlig, the Scottish Executive, Bord na Gàidhlig and Highlands and Islands Enterprise. The project is now moving ahead and it is planned to incorporate some 250,000 words, including declined forms. This will be a vital support for the whole Gaelic-speaking community in Scotland, especially in the field of education;
- **A'Chuisle** – The inaugural conference for the Gaelic teachers network was held in Nairn in November 2002. This was organised by HM Inspectors of Education and Stòrlann. Learning and Teaching Scotland have agreed to organise the next event of this network which will be held in March 2004;
- **HM Inspectors of Education Task**. HMIE have decided to focus a 'task' on the provision of Gaelic education in Scotland. This task will run from Summer, 2003 to Easter 2004. A team from HMIE will be involved in collecting evidence for this Report and this will make an important contribution to our understanding of Gaelic education at all levels;
- the Scottish Executive announced in February 2003, the extension of Gaelic road signs in the West Highlands of Scotland. Existing road signs would be replaced with new bilingual signs on a number of trunk roads. The signs will be introduced over a five year programme.

Irish / Ulster Scots

On the need to improve the provision of Irish-medium public service broadcasting, The Department for Culture, Arts and Leisure (DCAL) has funded the first part of a 2- year pilot training scheme for Irish language film and television production. The first stage of the pilot course was independently reviewed and the recommendations are currently being considered with a second pilot being planned.

A draft business case outlining the need for an Irish language broadcasting fund, has been prepared and is currently under consideration. This has an indicative budget of £12 million over three years.

The UK Government is vigorously pursuing methods to increase coverage of the Irish Language TV station, TG4, to Northern Ireland. Much progress has been made towards resolving the many technical and copyright difficulties. We would expect this to result in substantially improved coverage in 2004. We are also considering, with the Irish Government, a terrestrial solution.

The issuing of radio licensing is a matter for the Radio Authority (OFCOM as from 29th December). The UK Government sets the legal framework for licensing but has no involvement in individual license decisions.

Steps are being taken to create conditions for the use of Ulster-Scots in public life. A 'Future Search conference' was held by DCAL (November 2002) to establish an agreed vision for the Ulster-Scots Language and culture. The follow up is planned to include a language planning sub-group, which will include language enthusiasts and native speakers. Guidance will be issued to public servants outlining how they should allow Ulster-Scots to be used in public life. An Ulster Scots voicemail has also recently been set up by DCAL to accept oral submissions in Ulster-Scots.

The UK Government would also note that the Interdepartmental Charter Implementation Group in Northern Ireland has established a sub group which is considering the scope for applying those provisions of Article 9 which relate to the use of Irish in the courts within the context of the Criminal Justice Review.

Departments within Northern Ireland (including DCAL) are currently in discussions with representatives of the local community and the private sector regarding the establishment of a Gaeltacht Quarter in West Belfast based on Irish language, culture and traditions.

The UK Government also notes that plans for an 'Ulster-Scots Academy' are being developed (as outlined in the joint declaration in April 2003).

Cornish

The UK Government will give a full account of measures taken with regard to the Cornish language in its next periodical report. In the meantime, the UK Government would like to make brief comments on further progress on the language:

The UK Government is represented, through the Government Office for the South West, on a Cornish Language Advisory Group and a Cornish Language Strategy Steering Group set up in Spring 2003. The Steering Group is leading the process of the development of a strategy. A series of consultation meetings has been held, involving public open meetings and a series of focus groups of organisations. The intention is to have a strategy in place by April 2004. The UK Government is contributing to the cost of this work.

3. Supplementary Information

The UK Government would also like to offer clarification on certain factual points:

Paragraph 28: The UK Government is not aware of any recent research estimating there are 100,000 Ulster-Scots speakers. A representative survey of 2,200 adults in 1999 found that two per cent of respondents identified themselves as Ulster-Scots speakers, which would suggest there are around 33,000 speakers in Northern Ireland. To our knowledge there has been no more recent research than this.

30: The cross-border bodies are Foras na Gaeilge and Tha Boord o Ulstèr-Scotch.

31: It is the UK Government's understanding that Cornish ceased as community speech at the end of the 18th century, although knowledge of the language persisted in family tradition, and it was revived in the early 20th century.

38: The UK Government has a different interpretation of events. The local registering authority were, at the parents request, considering the use of two names, the Gaelic and English equivalent. At this point the parents informed the media that they were being refused the right to register their child with a Gaelic name. This is legal and many Gaelic speakers have done this before. The authorities then informed the parents that it was not possible to register a child with two names (Gaelic and English), only one was acceptable, Gaelic or English. The registering authorities response did not compromise our Charter obligations.

49: The UK Government should point out that the creation of a South-West Regional Authority is not a foregone conclusion. A referendum would need to be held before such an Authority could be created. At

present, the South West of England is an area where the UK Government judges interest in a referendum to be low. The situation will be reviewed if interest in a referendum were to increase.

53: The Scottish Parliament's policy on Gaelic will be issued in March 2004

59: The Gaelic Board was created in June 2002 and a Chairman was appointed in October 2002. The Board came into operation after the visit of the Committee.

80: The UK and Irish Governments jointly decided the budget of the North South Language Body, including Foras na Gaeilge. This was reduced in 2003 but was subsequently restored during the course of that year.

162: The UK Government is not aware of the need for specific equipment for selecting the Welsh sound track on the digital television service, S4C2, apart from the equipment required to receive digital television in the first instance.

194: The 1980 Education (Scotland) Act states that, 'school education...includes...the teaching of Gaelic'.

208: There are now 19 secondary schools, with 375 pupils.

241: There are two Gaelic officers in the Scottish Parliament – A Gaelic Information Officer and a Gaelic Outreach Officer.

242: Both the Scottish Parliament and the Scottish Executive produce Gaelic versions of important national reports.

261: Funding for Gaelic Broadcasting has not been cut since 1998. In cash terms, the Gaelic Broadcasting Fund has remained constant since 1999 with periodic cash injections from the Scottish Executive.

313: The Department for Employment and Learning has extended the pilot programme delivered by Forbairt Feirste and funded through BIFHE until June 2004.

313, 314, 365: Department for Employment and Learning is the correct title for the Department.